

Timeline of emails

Source: Subject Access and Freedom of Information Act requests

July 2014

12.16 1 July 2014

Paul Younger, Rankine Chair of Engineering and Professor of Energy Engineering, University of Glasgow (UoG) to David Smythe, Emeritus Professor of Geophysics, UoG saying he was “saddened to hear” that David Smythe had used his emeritus professor status during a programme on Radio Scotland to, in Paul Younger’s words, “tacitly imply that you have some meaningful connection to the present-day research base here at the University of Glasgow”. He accused David Smythe of misrepresenting geosciences and hydrogeology in particular. Paul Younger disputes that the Royal Academies’ report restricted itself to seismicity. He added: “I find your attempts to sow doubts in the mind of the general public by making claims that run counter to the basics of groundwater hydraulics and geochemistry utterly appalling”. He said David Smythe’s activities risked “damaging our reputation in the eyes of the scientific community”. He added that if they appeared on a public platform together “I shall not hesitate to denounce your charade of pretended knowledge and expose your much-vaunted links to the University of Glasgow for the cold historical artefact that they are.” Paul Younger also questioned whether David Smythe was a chartered geologist.

00.22 4 July 2014

David Smythe to John Chapman, Vice-Principal and Head of College of Science and Engineering, UoG, “correcting factual errors” in what he describes as “an abusive email” from Paul Younger which had been copied to John Chapman and the BBC. David Smythe said he was “indeed a chartered geologist, with four decades of professional practice and consultancy”.

13.23 4 July 2014

John Chapman to Dorothy Welch, Deputy Secretary (Court Office), Paul Younger and Maggie Cusack, Professor of Biomineralisation (School of Geographical and Earth Sciences) saying he would acknowledge an email from David Smythe.

13.52 4 July 2014

Paul Younger to John Chapman, Dorothy Welch and Maggie Cusack in which he says he and others can “provide detailed documents of how his [David Smythe’s] meticulous research is completely mis-conceived – mainly due to the fact he has no hydrogeological background.” He accuses David Smythe of “misleading the public”.

08.54 7 July 2014

John Chapman to Dorothy Welch, Paul Younger and Maggie Cusack asking “any progress on determining what steps we might take to distance ourselves from David Smythe’s views?”

12.43 16 July 2014

Paul Younger to John Chapman asks whether the issue of David Smythe has “progressed at all”. He says there is no record of David Smythe ever being a chartered geologist or a member of the Geological Society. He says David Smythe has “made this fraudulent claim to being a Chartered Geologist in two public documents submitted to a recent planning inquiry. Paul Younger adds “this to my mind heightens the case for, at very least, removing his access to a University of Glasgow email address. He also says he wished the university could “strike off” emeritus status

13.08 16 July 2014

Dorothy Welch to Paul Younger and John Chapman saying she has sent a “cease and desist” letter to David Smythe asking him “not to give the impression of misrepresenting the University”. She adds: “We cannot easily withdraw access to UoG email as it was part of an agreement when he left us; that said, if he continued to bring the University into disrepute we could escalate the situation”. Dorothy Welch adds that the university doesn’t have a procedure for withdrawing emeritus status and she says: “We do need to be careful about running the risk of ‘defaming’ DS so best that you don’t engage directly with him”.

09.25 23 July 2014

Paul Younger to Dorothy Welch and John Chapman sending link to an article in Click Green quoting David Smythe. Paul Younger says “Smythe has clearly paid no heed to your letter”

14.16 23 July 2014

John Chapman to Paul Younger and Dorothy Welch asking about alternatives for the next step.

14.18 23 July 2014

John Chapman to David Newall, Secretary of Court and Director of Administration UoG, Paul Younger and Dorothy Welch asking for suggestions about “the Smythe problem”

21.37 23 July 2014

David Newall to John Chapman, Paul Younger and Dorothy Welch questioning whether a cease and desist letter would have arrived. He said he would rather not react at this stage.

21.40 23 July 2014

Paul Younger to David Newall stating “Various industrial research partners have suggested an open letter to major newspapers making clear he does not speak for us. Not sure ...”

13.51 30 July 2014

Paul Younger to David Newall, Maggie Cusack, John Chapman and Dorothy Welch, plus cc’d to seven others. Paul Younger says he spoke to a Sunday Telegraph journalist about David Smythe. “I strongly feel that scientific integrity is at stake and silence can be misconstrued as support – I think Smythe has relied on this hitherto”.

August 2014

13.05 13 August 2014

David Smythe to Dorothy Welch enclosing a letter for David Newall's attention following comments about him in national papers.

13.13 13 August 2014

Dorothy Welch to David Newall forwarding David Smyth's letter

16.09 15 August 2014

David Newall to Maggie Cusack and Paul Younger requesting a meeting to discuss David Smyth's letter before sending a reply

16.20 15 August 2014

Paul Younger to David Newall suggesting the University's "legal people" have a look at the letter and send a holding reply until he got back from holiday. Paul Younger also says "All I want is distance between his uninformed views and those of us who actively work and publish peer-reviewed papers on these topics". He refers to a possible libel action saying: "If he [David Smythe] was serious in that threat he'd have had a lawyer draft this, not this amateur attempt which any specialist in such cases would have advised him not to write". He attaches a note from a magistrate (sent to the Geological Society but copied to Paul Younger) who suggests if David Smythe has done paid work in which he represented himself as a chartered geologist it could be "dishonestly obtaining for himself a pecuniary advantage by a deception, which on conviction carries a maximum sentence of 5 years in prison and/or an unlimited fine.

16.33 15 August 2014

David Newall to Paul Younger and Maggie Cusack saying he is happy to leave it until September.

16.35 15 August 2014

Paul Younger to David Newall and Maggie Cusack attaches a QC summing up about David Smythe's testimony at a public inquiry.

12.26 25 August 2014

REDACTED@msn.com to REDACTED@btinternet.com, subject REDACTED, asking "what direction did you drill the balcome [sic] HZ well to the east or west". The email contains the link:
<http://www.southampton.at.uk/~imw/Petroleum-Geology-Weald-Shale.htm#PGSB-6-3>

13.00 25 August 2014

REDACTED@btinternet.com to Robert Westaway, Senior Research Fellow UoG, in reply to a request asking about the direction of drilling of the balcome [sic] HZ well. The writer said: "Bearing was 250, length 2720ft"

15.30 25 August 2014

REDACTED to Robert Westaway, in reply to a request asking about the direction of drilling of the balcome [sic] HZ well. The writer said “250 W, HZ Length 2720ft”

15.30 25 August 2014

Robert Westaway to REDACTED – thanks

October 2014

11.07 13 October 2014

From REDACTED, specialist advisor at Lancashire County Council, to Paul Younger attaching a representation from David Smythe about Cuadrilla’s planning applications at Roseacre Wood and Preston New Road. The writer says “We note that David Smythe addresses himself as Emeritus Professor of Geophysics with the University of Glasgow. I would normally expect representations that claimed an affiliation with the University of Glasgow to be supported by the University. The writer asks whether Paul Younger has any comments.

11.34 13 October 2014

Paul Younger to David Newall reporting that David Smythe had ignored a previous request to not present himself as representing the university. He attaches a letter from Lancashire County Council which said David Smythe had sent a representation on Cuadrilla’s fracking applications. Paul Younger says David Smythe is “making representations on areas outside his expertise, but within those of myself and Dr Rob Westaway”.

12.06 13 October 2014

David Newall to Paul Younger stating that his letter to David Smythe said “We do not intend to make public statements about him”. But he says “I think we do have to respond to REDACTED question/concern. David Newall says he is happy to review a response.

12.26 13 October 2014

Paul Younger to David Newall in which he promises to make David Newall aware of all correspondence.

21.10 14 October 2014

Paul Younger to REDACTED specialist advisor to Lancashire County Council cc to Robert Westaway and REDACTED. Paul Younger says "D K Smythe retired from this University 17 years ago and has no affiliation with the present research team here. He says David Smythe "never visits" the university and "has no knowledge of contemporary work here, such as that en [sic] hydrology and induced seismicity". He adds that David Smythe had not published a peer-reviewed paper on any topic since 2002 and when he did publish it was not peer-reviewed on hydrology and induced seismicity. The message ends with Paul Younger saying: "The University recently wrote to D K Smythe requesting that he desist from giving the impression he is actively affiliated with us. He never responded but it would appear he does not intend to respect this request". Paul Younger said he and Robert Westaway would review the document and "give you an objective appraisal from the perspective of the actual Glasgow University research team".

21.12 14 October 2014

Paul Younger to Robert Westaway forwarding email from Lancashire County Council about a representation on Cuadrilla's planning applications by David Smythe.

16.10 15 October 2014

From REDACTED@lancashire.gov.uk to Paul Younger, cc to Robert Westaway. The writer thanks for the comments and adds "We would be grateful of your consideration of REDACTED documents and we appreciate the time that you may take in doing this".

10.54 16 October 2014

Cuadrilla to REDACTED asking about any update to "the request to use Bowland gas analyses in his rebuttal of the Manchester paper? I think they're keen to get the paper submitted as soon as possible".

12.07 16 October 2014

REDACTED@msn.com to Robert Westaway and Paul Younger headed FW: gas analyses. Content redacted but includes email of 10.54 16 October

12.37 16 October 2014

Robert Westaway to undisclosed recipients saying "We need to get moving on this correction as if it is delayed much longer the journal will refuse to consider it as the topic will no longer be current in relation to their original publication. He refers to a paper from Manchester University which he says claims UK shale gas might be "sour" and may cause significant levels of air pollution. He says "we would like to publish the attached table showing that a number of zero measurements of hydrogen sulphide have been made by APT. He request permission to disclose these measurements.

12.03 17 October 2014

REDACTED to Robert Westaway, REDACTED, cc to REDACTED and Paul Younger. The writer says "I understand your frustration" and adds: "We do not have definitive evidence there was no H2S on the basis of the results that APT generated from Isotubes analysed some time [sic] after the gases were collected". It adds "If you want to state that is absolutely no evidence that the Carboniferous mudstones contain H2S I think you can probably state that with some certainty".

12.09 17 October 2014

REDACTED@Cuadrillaresources.com to REDACTED and Robert Westaway, cc to REDACTED and Paul Younger in which the writer says "I understand there were no direct measurements of H2S values. A standard warning system was never activated which "is consistent with your observations".

12.27 17 October 2015

Robert Westaway to undisclosed recipient(s). Robert Westaway writes "So is the upshot of this that is is [sic] OK for us to cite and use the APT report in the manner we have requested please? Also, can we please cite REDACTED as a REDACTED to the effect that no hydrogen sulphide was detected at any stage during the Preese Hall operation. He also asks for the concentration threshold at which the detectors were set.

13.35 17 October 2015

REDACTED to undisclosed recipient(s). REDACTED agrees to be cited that no hydrogen sulphide was detected during the Preese Hall operation but asks for the wording proposed to be used in the document.

13.40 17 October 2015

REDACTED@Cuadrillaresources.com to REDACTED, cc to Robert Westaway, REDACTED and Paul Younger. The writer says "I'm waiting info from the loggers on the detection limits".

14.36 21 October 2014

Robert Westaway to REDACTED@Cuadrillaresources.com attaching proofs of a paper on induced seismicity from fracking.

November 2014

11.53 5 November 2014

Ross Barker, UoG media relations officer, to Paul Younger quoting the Canterbury Times that David Smythe was attending a public debate that month. Ross Barker said "looks like David Smythe is still using his emeritus professor title.

11.57 5 November 2014

Paul Younger to David Newall stating that David Smythe is "not in any way honouring the request we made that he cease from quoting his Glasgow affiliation".

February 2015

12.32 6 February 2015

Robert Westaway to REDACTED, copied to REDACTED@Cuadrilaresources.com. Robert Westaway says he has been asked to give a talk about shale gas developments. He says he has been “checking up on the issues underlying the recent recommendation for Lancashire council to reject Cuadrilla’s plans”. He adds “These issues have nothing to do with geology, so it doesn’t really need me to talk about them, but what the heck!” Robert Westaway refers to noise and lorry movements at the proposed sites at Roseacre Wood and Preston New Road as reasons for the recommended refusal. He includes a copy of an OS map and proposes a temporary junction on the M55 motorway to solve traffic issues and possible temporary speed limit on the motorway. He also said “I hope it is possible to accommodate this change [from 42 decibels to under 40 for night time working at the sites]. He also refers to lorry movements in the 1970s removing concrete from the Inskip airfield runways. He adds: “Maybe you can pass these suggestions on to the folks at Cuadrilla – I hope this helps!”

15.15 10 February 2015

REDACTED to Robert Westaway, cc to REDACTED@Cuadrilaresources.com. The writer says “This is duly passed on to them via REDACTED email.

March 2015

19.48 11 March 2015

REDACTED to Robert Westaway confirming Robert Westaway as speaker at the Shale Gas Environmental Summit

21.23 11 March 2015

Robert Westaway to Paul Younger stating that David Smythe is also a speaker at the Shale Gas Environmental Summit. He asks “Can nothing be done about this?”

09.41 12 March 2015

Paul Younger to David Newall reporting that David Smythe would be on the platform at the Shale Gas Environmental Summit. He asks the university to send a letter to the conference organisers pointing out that David Smythe does not represent the “present-day research team”.

May 2015

16.37 15 May 2015

REDACTED@cuadrilaresources.com to Robert Westaway, subject Hello. The writer expresses interest in Robert Westaway’s comment to *Applied Energy*. The writer says: “Your scientific contribution to the often over-heated UK shale gas debate is very much appreciated”. The writer proposes a meeting to discuss Cuadrilla’s “current drilling programme and timing or any other items that you might be interested in”.

16.51 15 May 2015

Robert Westaway to REDACTED, cc Paul Younger, subject Hello. Robert Westaway welcomes opportunity to meet and mentions possible dates.

11.11 18 May 2015

Robert Westaway to undisclosed recipient(s) proposing meeting [with Cuadrilla] between 9 and 11 June.

15.40 22 May 2015

REDACTED to Robert Westaway, cc Paul Younger thanking for dates.

16.10 22 May 2015

REDACTED@cuadrillaresources.com to Robert Westaway and Paul Younger proposing “holds” in REDACTED’s diary for 9 and 10 June.

16.18 22 May 2015

Robert Westaway to REDACTED and Paul Younger proposing finalising arrangements when Paul Younger returns from holiday.

09.54 29 May 2015

REDACTED and REDACTED@cuadrillaresources.com to Paul Younger and Robert Westaway asking about Paul Younger’s availability for a meeting on 9 or 10 June in Glasgow.

June 2015

15.46 1 June 2015

Robert Westaway to REDACTED and Paul Younger confirming 9 June 2015 for lunch and meeting for all three for the “rest of the afternoon” after 2pm.

09.16 2 June 2015

REDACTED to Robert Westaway and Paul Younger referring to REDACTED (Cuadrilla)’s flight options to Glasgow and time of arrival.

15.11 3 June 2015

REDACTED to Robert Westaway and Paul Younger cc REDACTED confirming REDACTED’s flights and expected arrival at Glasgow University at 12 noon on 9 June 2015 and saying he will also be bring REDACTED with him.

10.48 10 June 2015

Robert Westaway to REDACTED and Paul Younger saying it was “great to meet you both yesterday”. Robert Westaway asked to be reminded of a term used for the time delay between fluid injection and induced seismicity and Cuadrilla’s “preferred explanation” for Preese Hall.

10.57 10 June 2015

REDACTED@cuadrillaresoures.com to Robert Westaway, Paul Younger and REDACTED@cuadrillaresoures.com (x2) explaining the “trailing effect” and referring to a geotechnical study of Preese Hall and Clark et al.

January 2016

10.19 29 January 2016

David Newall to Lesley Carr, IT Officer, requesting termination of David Smyth’s email account

February 2016

9.03 2 February 2016

Lesley Carr to David Newall reporting that David Smythe had contacted the Helpdesk requesting his email account be fixed.

10.06 2 February 2016

David Newall to Lesley Carr in which he asks her to send a message to David Smythe. The message says that he is unclear why David Smythe has an email account and it should be closed. The message asks “If there is a reason why you believe you should continue to have an email account with the University, please let me know what it is”.

10.09 2 February 2016

Lesley Carr to Kenneth Whyte, IT Help Desk UoG, asking for the message to be sent.

15.59 2 February 2016

Robert Westaway to undisclosed recipient(s). Robert Westaway refers to a draft article by David Smythe, just published online by Solid Earth, which is now open for comment. Robert Westaway says there are four weeks in which to comment.

20.38 2 February 2016

REDACTED@cuadrillaresources.com to Robert Westaway, cc to REDACTED and Paul Younger, subject David Smythe publication. The sender thanks Robert for his email.

10.32 5 February 2016

Robert Westaway to REDACTED@cuadrillaresources.com (x2) and Paul Younger. Robert Westaway writes: “David Smythe, being as he is such a champion of fair, open scientific debate, has requested that some of my commentary be deleted. So if you would like to see the ‘unexpurgated version you should download it right away.

17.26 4 February 2016

Martin Lee, head of the School of Geographical and Earth Science at Glasgow University, to David Newall in which he says David Smythe’s Glasgow email address is still active.

17.34 4 February 2016

David Newall to Martin Lee informing him that David Smythe's email account had been deactivated. He says "I expect Professor Smythe will challenge this, and will argue that, as an Emeritus Professor, he has a right to an email account. But I am comfortable with the decision".

May 2016

11.54 14 May 2016

From REDACTED of the Solid Earth Editorial Board to Paul Younger informing him of a comment by Federico Rossetti in the online discussion on David Smythe's article to Solid Earth discussions.

16.53 25 May 2016

Rob Edwards (Sunday Herald environment editor) to Liz Buie, Elizabeth McMeekin, Jane Chilton, Ali Howard (all UoG communications officers) and UoG media email putting allegations by David Smythe about his cancelled email and journal access.

16.53 25 May 2016

Rob Edwards to Paul Younger asking for help with an article about David Smythe cancelled email and access to scientific journals.

21.14 25 May 2016

David Newall to Peter Aitchison, social and digital media manager, with a statement for the Sunday Herald about the terminated email access. The statement says this was "part of a routine review of email accounts in the School of Geographical and Earth Sciences" and that David Smythe had "no continuing practical association with the work of the university".

07.38 26 May 2016

Peter Aitchison to Paul Younger asking for a conversation about Rob Edwards' Sunday Herald article

07.40 26 May 2016

Paul Younger to Peter Aitchison, cc to David Newall in which he said he was happy to leave the Sunday Herald inquiry to David.

08.03 26 May 2016

Paul Younger to Peter Aichison referring to an inquiry from a Sunday Herald reporter about David Smythe. Paul Younger says "Happy to leave this entirely to you". He adds that David Smythe's paper was recently rejected as "scientifically unsound" and "his grandstanding is misplaced".

08.26 29 May 2016

Peter Aitchison to Paul Younger, David Newall and Martin Lee in which he refers to the Rob Edwards story, which has not appeared in the Sunday Herald. "Either means he has concluded that the allegations from prof Smythe are so meagre they do not warrant a story; his editor has seen that it doesn't warrant a story; or it is being held back".

09.59 31 May 2016

Paul Younger to Peter Aitchison, David Newall and Martin Lee in which he says “Hopefully not the latter – thanks for your vigilance REDACTED”.

June 2016

16.56 1 June 2016

FOI office to David Newall, Robert Westaway, Paul Younger, Carolyn Timar, financial accountant UoG, and Lee McClure, PA to Secretary and Deputy Secretary of Court UoG, attaching an FOI request.

09.33 2 June 2016

Paul Younger to FOI Office, David Newall, Robert Westaway, Carolyn Timar, and Lee McClure in which he says the University Court per se has never written to myself or Rob Westaway concerning David Smythe and neither of them had written to the court about him.

10.21 14 June 2016

Peter Aitchison to David Newall, Paul Younger and Muffy Calder, Vice Principal and Head of College of Science and Engineering, UoG, saying an article by Rob Edwards “never made it to the Herald (yet) so it has gone out on an online site called the ferret”. The article include links to emails sent to David Smythe

11.56 14 June 2016

Muffy Calder to Peter Aitchison, David Newall and Paul Younger saying “I read with interest”.

12.56 14 June 2016

Paul Younger to Muffy Calder, Peter Aitchison and David Newall stating “Were I his editor at the Herald I would take a dim view of this behaviour”.

19.22 14 June 2016

John Marsh, Professor of Optoelectronic Systems, Transnational Education Dean, to Paul Younger saying he had received a complaint from David Smythe and asking to discuss.

20.44 14 June 2016

Paul Younger to John Marsh in which he says “We shouldn’t let Smythe open up a new front in his endless attempts to pretend he knows Hydrogeology when he demonstrably doesn’t” and recommends the complaint should be passed immediately to David Newall.